

Information About the Millbrook Arena Emanating from the Parks and Recreation Plan

Township of Cavan Monaghan

June 5, 2023

**Prepared by:
The Rethink Group
*Leisure Services Planning and Management***

Selwyn, Ontario



Findings and Conclusions to Date Regrading the Millbrook Arena

This report is focussed on the Millbrook Arena. It comprises technical information about the facility, what is known about demand that would relate to this type of facility, community opinion about options for the future of Millbrook Arena, and identification and analysis of options for Council to consider.

Technical Information

The following recent studies have been undertaken to examine the condition and utilization of the Millbrook Arena.

1. **Arena/Community Centre Needs and Feasibility Study, 2014** – The Rethink Group, Leisure Services Planning and Management
2. **Mechanical Site Condition Assessment Report, September 3, 2019** - Kirkland Engineering LTD.
3. **Electrical Site Condition Assessment Report, September 6, 2019** - Kirkland Engineering LTD.
4. **Structural Investigation Report on the Millbrook Arena, 2019** - Barry Bryan Associates, Architects, Engineers, Project Managers
5. **Update of the 2019 Structural Investigation Report to Assess the Feasibility of Renovating the Millbrook Arena or Utilizing the Space in Other Ways, 2022** - Barry Bryan Associates, Architects, Engineers, Project Managers
6. **Background Report in support of Vision 2035, The Parks and Recreation Plan, Cavan Monaghan Township, 2023** - The Rethink Group, Leisure Services Planning and Management
7. **Designated Substances Survey of the Millbrook Arena, 2023** – Cambium Inc.

Summary of Information About the Millbrook Arena

- The 72-year-old building is in poor and deteriorating physical condition.
- The building does not meet provincial accessibility standards for community buildings. This must be addressed by 2025. (Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act).
- Mould (ceiling insulation throughout the building), Asbestos (tiles, drywall, caulking), Lead (paint), Mercury (lighting), Silica (concrete products) and PCBs (likely in lighting ballasts) were discovered in 2023. However, the air quality is not negatively impacted by mould growth at this time.
- The playing surface is under-sized (75' x 175' – the standard is 100' x 200').
- The facility is mainly used for indoor soccer and by the Arena Lacrosse League (Peterborough Timbermen) during the winter season.
- The facility is extremely underutilized (57% of Prime Time, no Non-Prime Time winter use and no summer use).
- Only the main floor is accessible and used.

- The site is small (0.43 ha./1.05 ac.), there is very limited on-site parking and the building is in a floodplain and susceptible to annual flooding.
- It is estimated that in the order of \$5.25 million will be required to retain the building pretty much “as is” for another 25 years – to support uses similar to the current ones. This does not include dealing with the mould.
- Much more investment will be required to increase functionality, uses and the appeal of the building. Because of the small size of the site, it is unlikely that the building can be enlarged to accommodate additional components. The second-floor multipurpose room could be renovated for community use and municipal programming.
- The cost to keep the building operational for a few more years (post 2025) is not yet known. (removal of mould, roof repair, replacement of the insulation and related works, upgrade accessibility of the main floor to meet provincial standards (by 2025), other high priority repairs).
- Based on similar uses and a September - May season, the annual operating cost is expected to be in the order of \$10,000 to \$15,000.
- A minimum of \$200,000 is estimated to demolish the building, plus the cost to remove hazardous materials and to perform other tasks to prepare the site for a new use.
- A \$708,367 grant has been approved to assist with renovation of the facility.
- As directed by Council, the Municipality is committed to operating the Millbrook Arena status quo annually from September through May, dependent upon the operations and building conditions being consistently reviewed and monitored for fiscal responsibility and community safety, given the condition of the facility.
- Financial Implication: An investment in this building will reduce the amount of money available to invest in parks and other culture and recreation facilities throughout the Township over the new decade and beyond.

Demand for Arts and Culture - Related to Facilities Like the Millbrook Arena

Since the Millbrook Arena is now a ‘turf floor’ facility, information about current and future demand will focus on a fieldhouse type of facility that, at minimum would have a 100’ x 200’ turf floor that could be rolled up and/or covered with a hard-surface floor in the summer and when necessary for other programming during the fall, winter and spring seasons. To optimize the facility, it would be heated and airconditioned to accommodate year-round use, and would have change rooms, washrooms, a foyer, storage, and possible other components and features. It could be attached to the Cavan Monaghan Community Centre, or it could be located in Maple Leaf Park. A case could be made for either option. However, if attached to the CMCC, the arena floor and multipurpose rooms would complement activities in the field house.

The household survey identified types of programming and activities that could be accommodated in a fieldhouse or a gymnasium type of facility (e.g., day camps, group fitness, Yoga, basketball, dance programs, gymnastics, volleyball, pickleball, children’s

programming, indoor soccer, floor hockey, youth programming, badminton, older adult programming).

One question in the household survey asked about priorities for investing in various types of indoor and outdoor culture and recreation facilities. An indoor soccer facility ranked 27th out of 36 listed facilities and a gymnasium ranked 16th. The survey didn't specifically ask about a fieldhouse.

Increasingly, municipalities are including a gymnasium in multi-facility community centres. This trend is resulting from the unreliability of access to school gymnasiums and increasing demand for municipal programming and events that require a gymnasium.

However, it should be noted that very few communities have a fieldhouse or an indoor soccer facility. Therefore, Cavan Monaghan is quite unique in having such a facility, which only came about because the Millbrook Arena recently became available for non-ice uses after the new CMCC opened.

The following are examples of the types of culture and recreation uses/programming that could be accommodated in a fieldhouse type of facility. Depending on the style and size of the facility, other uses may also be able to be accommodated. Many of these and additional activities are also well suited to a gymnasium.

- Indoor soccer,
- Field lacrosse,
- Ball hockey,
- Roller blading,
- Pickleball,
- Some types of traditional gym sports,
- Floor-based group fitness/wellness programming,
- Dance programs,
- Child and youth day camps,
- Performances/shows (drama, music, dance, shows) – with a portable stage and if the acoustics and the sound system are adequate to support quality experiences,
- Community gatherings/events,
- Religious services,
- Winter farmers market,
- Exhibitions/car shows,
- Trade shows, and
- Information/education programming.

Community Opinion About the Future of the Millbrook Arena

Community opinion about the future of the Millbrook Arena has been researched in the following ways:

- The Household Survey (summer, 2022),
- The Community Forum (May 10, 2023),
- Surveys to committees of Council and other community groups (2023), and
- Submissions/briefs from individuals and organisations (ongoing).

Via the Household Survey, the Community Forum and surveys to relevant Committees of Council, respondents were asked to rank the following four options for the future of the Millbrook Arena:

Option One

Invest in the order of \$5.25 million into the building and site to maintain the facility as status quo for another 25 years and to renovate it to meet accessibility requirements (by 2025). This investment would support current uses e.g., soccer and lacrosse. Accessibility deficiencies must be corrected by 2025. This option does not include any other functional or aesthetic improvements to the interior and exterior of the building. Limited parking will continue to be a major shortcoming.

Option Two

Invest considerably more than \$5.25 million into the building and site (interior and exterior) to extend its life for another 25 years and increase its functionality and appeal to support a few more uses. Possible new uses will depend on how the interior might be able to be transformed. The intent would be for the facility to be utilized year-round, including a new exterior design. Limited parking will continue to be a major shortcoming.

Option Three

Replace the building with a high-quality downtown community park that may accommodate some combination of facilities such as a farmer's market, shows/exhibitions, an outdoor stage or gazebo, pathways, gardens, trees, a picnic area, an outdoor exercise gym, an unstructured grass area, a public square, etc. With the proposed closure of Needler's Lane, the park could be integrated into the surrounding parkland and facilities. Via walkways, the park would be linked to the commercial component of the downtown, Old Millbrook School Park and the adjacent conservation area and pond.

Option Four

Sell the property and allow for a developer or business opportunity to invest in the downtown. This would support urban redevelopment plans and help to satisfy the need for additional commercial opportunities and or residential development in the downtown. This option would also support intensification requirements.

The overwhelming top choice is **Option Three** – to replace the arena with a high-quality downtown park. See below for the response from all of the sources of community engagement that asked about the future of the Millbrook Arena.

- | | |
|--|-----------|
| ▪ Household Survey | 82.5% |
| ▪ Community Forum | 75% |
| ▪ Sustainability Advisory Committee | Ranked #1 |
| ▪ Municipal Revitalization and Heritage Advisory Committee | Ranked #1 |

- Millbrook Business Improvement Area Executive Committee Ranked #1
- Millbrook Valley Trails Advisory Committee Ranked #1

Pros and Cons of Three Options for Council to Consider

To further assist Council, the pros and cons of three options defining the possible future of the Millbrook Arena and site have been prepared by the consultant and municipal staff. Please note that Option Two is a **new option** that emerged from the Community Forum. This new option is a variation on Option One. Option Three is the “park” option. They represent three directions for the future of the Millbrook Arena and site that Council may now want to consider and evaluate.

Option One: Invest \$5-6 million into the Millbrook Arena to maintain it for another 25 years in a status quo state, other than completing the required accessibility upgrades by 2025, and completing mould mitigation immediately.

Option Two (a variation on Option One): Keep the Millbrook Arena open for a few more years, in the hope of having a facility available to accommodate indoor soccer by that time. This option will require completing the required accessibility upgrades by 2025, completing mould mitigation immediately, and completing all high priority repairs that are necessary in the near term. An estimate of cost for these works is not available at this time.

Option Three: Replace the Millbrook Arena with a high-quality downtown park that would be integrated into adjacent public open space, the historic downtown and Old Millbrook School Park. This option is estimated to cost between \$830,000 and \$1,500,000.

The pros and cons of the three options are identified in Pages 6-8.

The Pros and Cons of Investing \$5-6 Million into the Millbrook Arena to Maintain it Status Quo for Another 25 Years

Pros	Cons
<p>Provide a winter home for: Indoor soccer (although on an under-sized playing surface) – for as long as the Soccer Club wants to remain at the Millbrook Arena.</p> <p>Box/arena lacrosse (for as long as they are viable and want to remain at the Millbrook Arena).</p> <p>The second-floor multipurpose room can be rejuvenated and utilized in the fall-winter-spring seasons for programming and community events.</p>	<p>It is estimated that between \$5 and 6 million will be required to maintain the facility in a safe, but status quo state for another 25 years, including the items identified and costed in the BBA report, not including the following items/actions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Immediately remove and replace the mouldy insulation and remove the mould from the ceiling cavity. ▪ Deal with other identified hazardous materials as/when required. ▪ Replace the playing surface carpet (near future). <p>Even with that substantial investment,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The facility will not be improved, beyond the required accessibility upgrades and the potential to reopen the second-floor multipurpose room. ▪ Without A/C, the facility will only be used in the fall-winter-spring seasons. ▪ The interior and exterior appearance of the facility will not be improved. ▪ Other spaces in the lower level would not be repurposed for community use. ▪ Because the way the facility was built, the construction materials, and its overall condition, the facility has a high carbon footprint. <p>That substantial investment in the Millbrook Arena will take away from the financial resources available for other facilities and parks.</p> <p>The return on that substantial investment is limited to providing:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A substandard winter home for indoor soccer and box/arena lacrosse for as long as they are viable and interested in using the facility. ▪ The three-season availability of a rejuvenated second-floor multipurpose room for programming and community events. <p>The Timbermen Lacrosse team could fold or move at any time.</p> <p>Maple Leaf Cavan FC will likely move to a better facility if one becomes available. Both the KPRD School Board and the City of Peterborough are actively investigating the feasibility of constructing a large field house that would accommodate indoor soccer and other activities.</p> <p>If both lacrosse and soccer move, there are no known users for the turf floor. If the carpet is removed, activities like winter roller skating, pickleball and ball hockey could be tried.</p> <p>Maintaining the Millbrook Arena for another 25 years will contribute less to downtown Millbrook than an attractive, high quality and busy park/community square that will be linked to King Street, Old Millbrook School Park, the Public Library, Millbrook Valley Trails and the ORCA lands – and support a wide variety of culture and recreation activities (e.g., farmers market, craft and art shows, concerts in the park, community events and celebrations, picnics and lunches, quiet relaxation, pond viewing, trail walking, fishing, skating, etc.)</p>

The Pros and Cons of Keeping the Millbrook Arena Open for a Few More Years and Then Decommission It

Pros	Cons
<p>A winter home will be provided for indoor soccer and box/arena lacrosse for a few more years.</p>	<p>At least the following actions and investments will be required to keep the facility operational and safe for a few more years:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Remove and replace the mouldy insulation throughout the facility. ▪ Remove any mould found within the ceiling cavity. ▪ Removing the insulation may require a new interior ceiling liner and other items. ▪ Repair or replace the roof and any other areas of water intrusion into the ceiling. ▪ Replace water-damaged drywall in the lower level of the facility. ▪ Complete the necessary accessibility upgrades to the lower level of the facility (if the facility is to be used past 2025). ▪ Repair and/or replace any other items that are required in the next few years. <p>The estimated cost for the above upgrades, repairs and replacements associated with this option is not available at this time.</p> <p>With that investment (TBD),</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The facility will not be improved, beyond the required accessibility upgrades. ▪ The second-floor multipurpose room will not be available. ▪ Without A/C, the facility will not be used in the summer. ▪ The interior and exterior appearance of the facility will not be improved. ▪ Other spaces in the lower level will not be repurposed for community use. <p>That investment (TBD) in the Millbrook Arena will take away from financial resources available for other facilities and parks.</p> <p>The return on that investment is limited to providing a substandard winter home for indoor soccer and box/arena lacrosse for a few more years.</p> <p>The Timbermen Lacrosse team may fold or move at any time.</p> <p>Maple Leaf Cavan FC will likely move to a better facility if one becomes available. Both the KPRD School Board and the City of Peterborough are actively investigating the feasibility of constructing a large field house that would accommodate indoor soccer and other activities.</p> <p>If too much money is invested in this facility, there will be increased incentive to keep it operational and invest more into it, assuming there are viable user groups. That will further reduce available financial resources that could be invested in other facilities and parks - that will provide more value to the community.</p>

The Pros and Cons of Replacing the Millbrook Arena with a Downtown Park

Pros	Cons
<p>Provide a high-quality park (non-sports) in Millbrook's downtown.</p> <p>The park's design will complement the historic character of the downtown.</p> <p>The park's features and activities will support the downtown's commercial activities and will contribute to its revitalization.</p> <p>The indirect economic impact of the park on the downtown will exceed the park's annual operation costs. Additionally, the health benefits of people interacting with the park could be over a million dollars a year, according to a recent University of Waterloo study on a similar park in Peterborough.</p> <p>In addition to the economic benefits, the park will provide considerable social, personal and environmental benefits to the community. The park will also contribute to climate change mitigation, in contrast to the high carbon footprint of the Millbrook Arena.</p> <p>The park <u>could</u> provide venues and features such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ an attractive and supportive location for the farmer's market ▪ a venue for concerts and community events ▪ a venue for craft, art and other shows ▪ a community square/gathering space ▪ walkways within the park and pedestrian linkages into the downtown, Old Millbrook School Park, the adjacent conservation area and the Millbrook Valley Trail network ▪ viewing areas to the pond, creek and Medd's Mountain ▪ picnic areas ▪ a playground ▪ display and pollinator gardens ▪ sun and shade areas ▪ areas for quiet reflection ▪ a natural ice rink on the pond ▪ a fishing wharf at the pond ▪ an area for tobogganing <p>The creation of an extensive, accessible and prominent open space campus encompassing the former Millbrook Arena site, Needler's Lane, Old Millbrook School Park, the adjacent ORCA lands, and the Millbrook Valley Trail lands.</p> <p>By not maintaining the Millbrook Arena for the next 25 years, it is estimated that \$5-6 million in capital costs will be able to be invested elsewhere.</p> <p>By not maintaining the Millbrook Arena for the next 25 years, an estimated \$400,000 - \$500,000 will saved in operating costs.</p>	<p>A downtown winter venue for indoor soccer and arena lacrosse will be lost.</p> <p>There will be a cost to demolish the Millbrook Arena and prepare the site for another use (at least \$200,000).</p> <p>There will be a cost to design, construct and maintain the proposed downtown park. An order of magnitude estimate of capital cost is \$830,000 - \$1,500,000, depending on what is included in the park and the quality of development.</p> <p>There will be little opportunity to generate direct revenue from this type of park.</p> <p>Although relatively low, there will be annual operating costs and long-term upgrades/replacements associated with this type of park.</p>